

[関西大学文学部主催] 英語による国際シンポジウム

International Symposium

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

開催目的

旧優生保護法(1948～1996)のもとで行われていた障害者の強制不妊手術をめぐって、2018年1月、宮城県の60代の女性が、知的障害を理由に手術をされたことは憲法違反だったとして国家賠償請求を起こしたことをきっかけに、いま全国各地で声があがり、実態の掘り起こしが進められている。そもそも、優生保護法が生まれた背景には、あるべき「完全」な人間像を設定し、それ以外を排除すべき「不完全」だと見なす人間観・世界観があった。このような悲劇を生まないために、芸術や音楽を通じた人間の感性の領域において「完全」と「不完全」を問い、「不完全」の倫理的文化的重要性を確立することは急務である。そのため、本シンポジウムを開催することで、以下の4点の実現をめざす。

(A) 「不完全」の概念を、美学一般での議論に発展させ、美学一般、視覚芸術理論、建築および都市美学、音楽、文学理論、文化および日常美学という6領域において、幅広い実践的および理論的な学術的貢献をおこなう。

(B) 上述の6領域を横断しながら、美学における「完全」と「不完全」を議論する国際的で学際的なフォーラムを構築する。

(C) 本シンポジウムを通して創出される学術領域の、方法的枠組や研究指針となるような予備的理論を創出する。

(D) 芸術や美学において積極的な価値をもつような、「不完全」の倫理的文化的重要性を確立する。このことが依拠する原理は、共同体の倫理や美学は相互依存的な極性を帯びているということである。倫理美学的極性の中心に、共同体の特性がある。倫理美学的な統合が生み出すものは、上演、芸術作品、文化的実践に具現された諸価値である。

特色・独創的な点

多数の障害者が殺害された一昨年の津久井やまゆり園での殺傷事件に際して、逮捕された元職員は、「障害者は、なにも出来ないくせに税金ばかりむだづかいするから、生きている

価値がないと思い、殺した」と答えた。これに対して「殺すのはいけないと思うけど、犯人の意見には同感」とする反応や、墓標に名前を記すことを拒む家族の姿も報じられた。法律としての優生保護法はなくなっても、「優生思想」は依然として根強く残っていると言わざるをえない。この問題を法律や国家賠償訴訟の問題として論じることも必要だし、福祉行政の問題として考えることも重要である。しかしながら、旧優生保護法第一章第一条に「不良な子孫の出生を防止」と記された「不良」すなわち「不完全」を、感性の問題として積極的に捉えなおさない限り、悲劇は繰り返されるだろう。感性の問題に緊急性は馴染まないとする考え方があってもいいが、そのように見なされるのは、従来、「不完全」概念を感性の問題として扱うことが少なかったからである。したがって、「不完全」概念の積極的な捉え直しを、美学一般、視覚芸術理論、建築および都市美学、音楽、文学理論、文化および日常美学において行おうとする点に、本シンポジウムの最大の特色および獨創性がある。

実際「不完全」という概念は、現代の美学すなわち感性学における重要な論点である。「不完全」な作品の意図的な創出は、予測不能性や人間臭さに寛容であることを受け入れる試みだと言えよう。このことは、倫理的にも一定の世界の見方に結びつく。マス・メディアは、技術面や最終結果における「完成」ばかりを追い求める傾向にあり、そのため感性的対象は無味乾燥なものになりがちである。近年、感性的経験の対象として「不完全」に関心が寄せられているのは、「不完全」に対する寛容さが一般に求められているためである。

「不完全」の評価は、国際的には、西洋の対称性（完全）に対して日本の非対称性（不完全）と言われたような、日本の美的感受性と記されてきたもの——たとえ日本国内よりも日本以外のところで人気があるにせよ——を背景としている。このシンポジウムのさらなる特色は、在日外国人研究者や海外在住（あるいは、それを経験した）日本人研究者など、多文化的領域においてこの問題に突き当たった研究者たちが一堂に会し、重要性が増しているこの問題を焦点化し、さらなる展開への出発点とする、「不完全」概念の核となるような議論を提供することにある。

開催にあたり、関西大学教育研究緊急支援経費から助成をうけました。

The 8th October (Mon.) 13 : 00 – 13 : 20 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

Imperfectionist Aesthetics and the Inclusionist Ethos

Peter Cheyne (Shimane University)

This paper proposes first the aesthetic category of ‘imperfectionism’, and argues for its merits. I then argue for the ethical merits of imperfectionist aesthetics, insofar as it contributes to an ethos of openness and inclusion.

There is a looseness, especially to certain rhythmic and improvisational arts, where the aesthetic of aliveness would be damaged if the artist went back and tried to ‘correct’ things. I argue that imperfectionist aesthetics is the disciplined refusal by an artist to return to make a correction. So-called ‘wrong notes’ might be played, or unplanned brush strokes made, but they are either left as organic marks of aliveness, or made right by what follows. Here I argue for the quality of the organic in imperfectionist works.

I then argue for the ethos of imperfectionism. I contrast Byung-Chul Han’s active ‘violence of perfection’, which I recast as a mode of perfectionism concerned mainly with imposing homogeneity, with a higher passivity that is equivalent to a traditional sense of wisdom that operates as a calm attention in contrast to lower-level hyperactive attention. Imperfectionist aesthetics opposes perfectionism, which it sees as overly striving for a high degree of formal perfection that prioritizes being executed to a thorough completion over more living and open qualities.

The ethical shortcomings of perfectionism lie in valuing forms and rules that promote symmetry, homogeneity, polish, regimen, mastery, imposition, correction, and so on, to the neglect of humane qualities such as openness, inclusion, humility, nonconformity, and acceptance. Imperfectionism is not here proposed as superior to perfectionism, but rather that it adds an important balance in creating an ethos of openness and inclusivity that is participatory and not only spectatorial. Arguably, while perfectionists conform to a series of rules that elevates their work above mere expression without discipline or the ideal of a pre-visualized (a priori) image of the complete work, imperfectionists adhere to the broader ideals of an embracing openness to the unforeseeable and the imperfectible. Imperfectionism thus embraces vital and humane qualities that are recalcitrant to completion and resist perfect assimilation.

The 8th October (Mon.) 13 : 25 – 13 : 45 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

Richard Long's Walk Works in Japan: Transference

Eriko Yamaguchi (Tsukuba University)

Richard Long, an English sculptor and land artist, makes works from his walks. He walks hundreds of miles alone and encounters a place where he piles up stones or makes a circle or a line of stones or branches he finds there. He calls these works “sculptures”. His sculpture gives a form to his invisible walking to be visible, but it will disappear after being photographed without leaving mark as a work. This principle of disappearance is against a traditional canon of art which requires art to be perfect and promote the present into an eternal future.

In Dartmoor in England Long made many of his works which focus on the accumulation of time, distance, and memories. From a walk on Dartmoor Long learned the world's continuous geographical movements. Walking is an action to demonstrate that we are part of this continuum. In Dartmoor Long began to pile up stones which contain a history of the place. As required by the agency of the stone and by the action of a walk, Long piles, carries, or exchanges stones from day to day and from place to place.

Long has walked various places of the earth, including Japan, and made walk-works in each place as if there were transference of the Dartmoor works. As far as he walks, a surface becomes a trace of the continuous transference and along it the work becomes something in a relationship with something else. Long's knowledge of the continuous movement of the world led him to think of the subatomic world, where particles are in a flux of changing relationships between speed, mass, positions and time. His sculptures are momentarily still but on another moment the stones of them moves somewhere else and disappear as seen in *Mind Rock, Japan Winter 1992* made in Kyoto. In this aesthetics of imperfection a human being becomes a particle and it finds a thing related somewhere else.

The 8th October (Mon.) 13 : 50 – 14 : 10 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

The Aesthetics of Weeds

Kaz Oishi (University of Tokyo)

This paper aims to explore and define the aesthetics of weeds in Japanese literature and art, with a special focus on Nishiwaki Junzaburō, a Japanese modern poet. Weeds or wild plants have traditionally been a favourite subject of Japanese poets, novelists, essayists, and painters. The delicate sensitivity to the trivial natural object is a unique artistic phenomenon, largely reflecting the Japanese culture rooted in Shintoism and Buddhism. *Haiku* is a good example which locates various kinds of weeds and wild plants within a framework of literary symbolism, reflecting the correspondence between the inner world and the great outdoors. They also appear in traditional paintings, charged with religious and philosophical meanings. While representing what Yuriko Saito defines as ‘everyday aesthetics’, the aesthetics of weeds habitually envisages a view of all sentient beings, including humans, animals, insects, and plants, as being permanently mutable and therefore imperfect, and consequently as being an integral part of ever-fluctuating nature. Politically speaking, it also suggests liberal and even populist sympathy towards common lives and their rights, often resonating with ecological implications.

The later poems and essays of Nishiwaki recapitulate this aesthetics of weeds. Though highly appraised as a modernist poet and well versed in English literature in the early twentieth century, Nishiwaki developed his strong attachment to ordinary, unnamed plants in his later years. He not only enjoyed rambling the untamed countryside stretching outside Tokyo in pursuit of common plants, but also relished weeds growing in the midst of increasingly urbanized Tokyo. For him, weeds symbolize small, indistinct, yet resilient lives of sentient beings: they embody insignificant, yet enduring patterns of their everyday existence—perhaps an aesthetic equivalent of Fernand Braudel’s ‘*longue durée*’. Admitting the excellence of Romanticism in establishing images of ordinary natural objects as a literary motif, he asserts that weeds are more appropriate as a symbolical image of modernity, in which all lives survive the urbanized, commercialized, and industrialized environment and quietly embrace existential anxiety and fragmentation. Though a study of Nishiwaki’s poems and essays, the paper examines the way in which the aesthetics of weeds are reconstructed in the age of modernity.

The 8th October (Mon.) 14 : 15 – 14 : 35 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

Yeats's Choice, “Perfection of the life or of the art”

Joseph O’Leary (formerly Sophia University)

Yeats’s *Collected Poems*, often treated as a single integrated work of art, conveys an image of perfection, as a ‘monument of unaging intellect.’ But on closer inspection this image begins to fray. Perfection, in Yeats’s imagination, figures as an elusive goal; it is a projection that haunts the poet at some points in his career, and that in his esoteric philosophy is associated with the 15th Phase of the Moon, the period of Byzantine civilization at its zenith, which is an utopian moment, ‘out of nature,’ where humans can scarcely exist. The book of Yeats’s poems is in reality a hugely varied exploration of all sorts of different possibilities of life and imagination. ‘What matter if the ditches be impure?’ ‘Vacillation’ is its basic rhythm, and any apparent position established at one stage is fated to be shattered at the next. The lofty system of *A Vision*, intended to hammer Yeats’s thoughts into unity, is a fragile, rickety construction, and is largely abandoned as the poet moves on to new ground.

Thus ‘what surrounds Yeats’s name is not the aura of an achieved poetry, a body of work separable from its origins, but an impression of genius fulfilled chiefly in the multiplicity of its life’ (Denis Donoghue). Branching out from the *Poems* to his other works, the plays and the prose, the image of a sovereign self-contained oeuvre is further compromised. Even within individual poems, self-contained perfection is not what is achieved or aimed at; rather there is a centrifugal tension between clashing emotional and imaginative investments (for instance in ‘The Tower,’ ‘Meditations in Time of Civil War,’ and ‘Nineteen Hundred and Nineteen’). In his poems Yeats systematically allows vitality to undermine perfection, and Donoghue holds that he chose ‘perfection of the life’ rather than ‘of the art’ (‘The Choice’) in his life as well. It was through investing fully in the multifarious passions and activities of real life that Yeats nourished his poetic vitality, and within that vitality he secretes a few perfect poems; but most of the poems are open-ended ‘fragments of a great confession’ (Goethe). Yeats’s greatness as a poet is thus paradoxically contingent on sustaining imperfection, leaving in each poem an unhealed wound, an element of trauma (notably in the disorienting finales of ‘Nineteen Hundred and Nineteen’ and ‘Meditations in Time of Civil War’). With his rocky ride behind him, Yeats forsook any idea of closure and completion in drawing his work to its end; on the contrary he made the ride still rockier in the late poems. His famed capacity for self-renewal depends on shattering moulds, as in the new tone struck in *Responsibilities*. This shattering is achieved or imposed by a turning away from poetic perfection to realities that mock it: petty bourgeois commercialism in 1914; the horrors of international and local war from 1919 (‘The Second Coming’) to 1923; raw sexuality in the ‘Crazy

Jane's poems of 1933. Artists are haunted by ideals of perfection, and if they were not, they would not be artists. Yet perfection is the enemy of art, stifling its Dionysian vitality by imposing an Apollonian mask. We should be happy that despite his strong Apollonian yearnings, Yeats never stopped Dionysus from leading him a merry dance.

The 8th October (Mon.) 15 : 00 – 15 : 20 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

Political Implications of Imperfection in Urban Aesthetics

Andrea Baldini (Nanjing University)

According to a recent poll, Banksy's *Girl with Balloon* is Britain's best-loved artwork. This result is not surprising. After turbulent beginnings, where all street art was often despised and its practitioners persecuted, the popularity of Banksy's works – and of those who use a similar representational style – is on the rise. Things are very different when we examine graffiti writing, another variety of street art largely based on lettering and calligraphic elements. Writers, as usually graffiti practitioners call themselves, are often treated differently from street artists working in a representational style.

Among the different styles of graffiti, *tagging* is the most despised. Tagging is the most basic and yet most radical form of graffiti writing. Though many today appreciate several styles of street art and graffiti, “tags,” that is, monochrome signatures of writers' street names, are still generally despised. Widely considered a form of vandalism, tagging is dismissed and criticized as pointless disruption of the aesthetics of the “perfect city”: a practice that ruins urban harmony and décor. However, tagging's undiluted power of introducing imperfection in the city's landscape has politically significant consequences requiring attention.

In this paper, I examine the heretofore largely overlooked practice of tagging and its subversive nature. I argue that, by challenging the city's decorum, tagging enriches our urban aesthetic lives while exposing the exclusionary nature of aesthetic ideals of urban perfection. In effect, perfect cities are created and maintained through processes of “othering” which rely on social marginalization and extensive policing. This finds an insightful analogy in practices of defensive architecture aimed at pushing poverty out of sight. Tagging – more than any other form of street art – enlarges the range of aesthetically rewarding experiences in the city and functions as an aesthetic antidote to dominant oppressive policies of urban development.

The 8th October (Mon.) 15 : 25 – 15 : 45 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

Imperfectionist Ethics and Aesthetics in Iris Murdoch

Fiona Tomkinson (Nagoya University)

The paper discusses Iris Murdoch's vision of (im)perfection in ethics and aesthetics with particular reference to her novel *An Accidental Man*, which will be presented in terms of a dialectic between the quest for perfection and an aesthetics (and perhaps also an ethics) of imperfection. I shall also consider the way in which this dialectic is entwined with Murdoch's use of Japanese themes and motifs, including references to Buddhism and Shintoism. These Japanese themes are connected with the quest for perfection through references to the ideals of monasticism and enlightenment, but also with the acceptance of the transitory and imperfect associated with the *wabi sabi* aesthetic, which appears in descriptions of falling leaves and cherry blossom.

My interpretation will challenge readings of the novel by Barbara Heusel and Valentine Cunningham which emphasise its pessimism and the moral bankruptcy of most of its characters. I argue for a more tolerant and nuanced reading which also takes account of the mythical elements from Western and Eastern sources which Murdoch evokes.

Finally, I discuss the relationship between the theme of imperfection in *An Accidental Man* and Murdoch's discussion of Japanese aesthetics in Chapter Eight of *Metaphysics as a Guide to Morals*, where Murdoch takes up Sekida's critique of Husserl's eidetic reduction and where the attempt to isolate a specific unified object is contrasted unfavourably with the fusing of subject and object achieved in *zazen* meditation, the solving of a *koan* and the composition of *haiku*. I shall argue that Murdoch's engagement with Japanese aesthetics was of vital importance for her project in this work of preserving something from the attacks on the idealist tradition of philosophy by the hermeneutics of suspicion – and that her thoughts in this late work are a continuation of a process which had already begun in *An Accidental Man*.

The 8th October (Mon.) 15 : 50 – 16 : 10 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

The Aesthetics of Ruins: Poetry East and West, A Comparative Study

Gregory Dunne (Miyazaki International College)

In his Preface to the *The Marble Faun*, a romance set in Rome in the mid-nineteenth century, the American writer Nathaniel Hawthorne famously wrote that ‘Romance and poetry, like ivy, lichens, and wall flowers, need Ruin to make them grow.’ This prefatory statement is often considered to be mere hyperbole, given that Hawthorne wrote three previous “romances” and all of them set in the United States where ruins are hardly to be found. This paper argues, however, that there is substantial evidence to regard the statement as genuine and significant in what it indicates about the writer’s aesthetic theory of imperfection and the role that it plays in the work of creation. The European travel journals of Nathaniel Hawthorne indicate how imperfection, incompleteness, fragmentation and ruins have contributed to his understanding of art, the imagination, and the creation of literature. In visiting the ruins of Furness Abby in England, for example, he spoke directly of the ruins being “a greater majesty and beauty than any human work can show . . . producing somewhat of the effect of the first idea . . . when it dawns upon the mind of an artist or a poet.” Similar aesthetic ideas regarding the aesthetics of imperfection and their relation to the creation of literary art are also to be found in the travel journals of Matsuo Basho. This paper examines the aesthetics of imperfection through a comparative study of the travel journals of Matsuo Basho and Nathaniel Hawthorne. It works to clarify how the artists understood the aesthetics of imperfection as central to their artistic activity. The paper also theorizes how travel itself fostered the development of their aesthetic ideas. It concludes by demonstrating that their ideas remain potent within their work, their respective traditions, and beyond the borders of their native lands.

The 8th October (Mon.) 16 : 15 – 16 : 35 〈Room A603〉

【英語による国際シンポジウム The International Symposium】

Perfect and Imperfect — Imperfectionist Aesthetics: Philosophy, Art, Culture

The Aesthetics of Perfection

James Kirwan (Kansai University)

This paper will explore the concept of an ‘aesthetics of imperfection’ by analysing it into its components: (1) the notion of the ‘perfection’ of an object in terms of function or type (essentially a non-aesthetic concept, but one that has played a role in some aesthetic theories); (2) the notion of the aesthetic value as itself a form of perfection; (3) the notion of imperfection in terms of function or type, which perhaps most commonly evokes a negative aesthetic reaction (disgust or the perception of ugliness), though it may also have a positive aspect (the grotesque); (4) the notion of aesthetic imperfection, as a departure from what is expected from an object intended for aesthetic consumption (the bum note, the anticlimax, the avant garde), which may or may not defer to the notion of aesthetic perfection that gave rise to the object (the restored Sistine Chapel ceiling, polychrome classical statues). Through a consideration of these categories the paper will attempt to refine precisely what constitutes an aesthetics of imperfection as a positive aesthetic response to what is perceived as imperfect. It will suggest that, in some instances, we can react negatively to the intention to represent “too perfectly”, where the ideal of perfection is perceived as depriving the object of animation. In such instances, imperfection, according to one standard, can evoke a more favourable aesthetic response than perfection. It will also argue that there may be a positive aesthetic aspect to works that are clearly imperfect in terms of their implicit original intentions (the works of Sappho, the Venus de Milo), or works that simulate such a condition. The paper will conclude by analysing why this might be so and by emphasizing that in every case of perceived perfection or imperfection the decisive factor is both the subject’s perception of the ideal and the subject’s tolerance for imaginatively entertaining the provenance of an object.